

# DOCUMENT RESUME

ED 103 391

SP 008 998

AUTHOR Nix, Jack P.  
TITLE Performance-Based Certification: A Selected Annotated Bibliography.  
INSTITUTION Georgia State Dept. of Education, Atlanta.  
PUB DATE 14 Mar 75  
NOTE 13p.  
  
EDRS PRICE MF-\$0.76 HC-\$1.58 PLUS POSTAGE  
DESCRIPTORS Annotated Bibliographies; Literature Reviews;  
\*Performance Based Education; \*Performance Based Teacher Education; \*State Agencies; \*Teacher Certification; Teaching Skills

## ABSTRACT

This annotated bibliography cites information helpful in obtaining an overview of (a) issues and problems in performance certification, (b) current developmental efforts by states in performance-based certification, and (c) alternative roles state agencies might assume in planning, developing, and implementing a performance-based certification program. It also contains technical information concerning research on teaching competencies and approaches to assessing them. The bibliography is divided into the following seven chapters: (a) Bibliographies on Competency-Based Teacher Education and Performance-Based Teacher Certification, (b) Teacher Education: State of the Art, (c) Competency-Based Education and Performance-Based Certification: A Survey of the States, (d) Teacher Competencies: Lists of Behaviors, (e) Review of Research on Validated Teacher Competencies, (f) Assessment of Competencies, and (g) State Agency Roles in Planning, Developing, and Implementing Competency-Based Teacher Education and Performance-Based Certification. All documents included are post-1970. (PB)

ED103391

PERFORMANCE-BASED CERTIFICATION:  
A SELECTED ANNOTATED BIBLIOGRAPHY

U.S. DEPARTMENT OF HEALTH,  
EDUCATION & WELFARE  
NATIONAL INSTITUTE OF  
EDUCATION  
THIS DOCUMENT HAS BEEN REPRO-  
DUCED EXACTLY AS RECEIVED FROM  
THE PERSON OR ORGANIZATION ORIGIN-  
ATING IT. POINTS OF VIEW OR OPINIONS  
STATED DO NOT NECESSARILY REPRESENT  
OFFICIAL NATIONAL INSTITUTE OF  
EDUCATION POSITION OR POLICY

Prepared by

Georgia State Department of Education  
Jack P. Nix, Superintendent

for

The Southeastern Interstate Project

March 14, 1975

PERFORMANCE-BASED TEACHER CERTIFICATION:  
A SELECTED ANNOTATED BIBLIOGRAPHY

TABLE OF CONTENTS

	Page
Introduction.....	i
I. Bibliographies on Competency-Based Teacher Education and Performance-Based Teacher Certification.....	1
II. Teacher Education: State of the Art.....	2
III. Competency-Based Education and Performance-Based Certification: A Survey of the States.....	2
IV. Teacher Competencies: Lists of Behaviors.....	3
V. Review of Research on Validated Teacher Competencies.....	3
VI. Assessment of Competencies.....	4
VII. State Agency Roles in Planning, Developing and Implementing Competency-Based Teacher Education and Performance-Based Certification.....	6

## INTRODUCTION

Performance-based certification is an area of increasing significance for state education agencies. This selected annotated bibliography on performance-based certification has been prepared by the Georgia Department of Education as a resource document for state education agency decision-makers in the Southeastern Interstate Project. The bibliography cites information helpful in obtaining an overview of (1) issues and problems in performance certification; (2) current developmental efforts by states in performance-based certification; and (3) alternative roles state agencies might assume in planning, developing and implementing a performance-based certification program. It also contains more technical information concerning research on teaching competencies and approaches to assessing them.

Documents cited in the bibliography have been carefully selected from numerous documents written in the areas of performance-based certification and education. A search of the ERIC collection was made and additional documents were obtained from the Competency-Based Preparation/Performance-Based Certification Unit (CBP/PBC). Final selection of documents was made by Lester M. Solomon, Director of CBP/PBC Unit, and consultant Carol Serrell, and staff of the Education Information Center, Georgia Department of Education. Criteria used for the selection of relevant documents were

1. relevance of information to state agency roles and responsibilities in competency-based teacher education and performance-based certification;
2. measurement and assessment emphasis;
3. readability and utility of information;
4. currentness of information.

This product represents a cooperative effort to provide state education agencies with an information resource of practical value.

Performance-Based Teacher Certification:  
a Selected Annotated Bibliography

I. Bibliographies on Competency-Based Teacher Education and Performance-Based Teacher Certification

Coker, Homer and Coker, Joan G. Carroll County Competency-Based Teacher Certification Project: Librarian's Report. Carrollton, Georgia: Carroll County Competency-Based Teacher Certification Project, 1974.

An extensive bibliography of reference materials on competency-based teacher education and certification. Books, pamphlets, cassettes, and journal articles are included. This compilation of resources provides a variety of information useful to developers of competency-based programs.

Kay, Patricia M. et al. Performance Based Certification. New York: City University of New York, 1971. (ED 056 991)\*

This annotated bibliography contains 115 citations ranging in date from 1957 to 1971. References are divided into five sections: 1) teacher certification and selection; 2) teacher education; 3) modeling, feedback, and audiovisual media techniques; 4) observation, measurement, and evaluation; and 5) research on teacher characteristics. When available, ERIC, author, AERA, or other abstracts have been included with the citation.

Performance-Based Teacher Education: An Annotated Bibliography. Washington, D. C.: American Association of Colleges for Teacher Education and the ERIC Clearinghouse on Teacher Education, 1972. (ED 065 477)

This annotated bibliography on performance-based teacher education is an update of one released in May 1971 by the American Association of Colleges for Teacher Education (ED 050 034). With 189 citations, the version contains nearly twice the number of entries as the previous one. The categories under which the entries are arranged have been expanded to include the following: the nature of performance-based teacher education (21 citations); programs (19 citations); kinds of performance (30 citations); modules (7 citations); the improvement of teacher performance (37 citations); the assessment of teacher performance (44 citations); performance-based teacher certification (20 citations); and attitudes of professional organizations (7 citations). A 5-item bibliography of bibliographies completes the document.

\*When available, Research in Education abstracts were used.

## II. Teacher Education: State of the Art

Elam, Stanley. Performance-Based Teacher Education. What is the State of The Art? Washington, D. C.: American Association for Teacher Evaluation, 1971. (ED 058 166)

This document clarifies the concepts of Performance Based Teacher Education, examines their potential, and identifies problems and questions. Five essential elements are identified: 1) teaching competencies to be demonstrated are role-derived, specified in behavioral terms, and made public; 2) assessment criteria are competency-based, specify mastery levels, and are made public; 3) assessment requires performance as prime evidence and takes student knowledge into account; 4) the student's rate of progress depends on demonstrated competency; and 5) the instructional program facilitates development and evaluation of specific competencies. Characteristics include program individualization and modularization; emphasis on exit rather than entrance requirements; the systemic, open approach, with feedback loops and program alternatives; and student and program accountability. The advantages of PBTE include: attention to individual abilities and needs, focus on objectives, emphasis on the sharing process by which these objectives are formulated and used as the basis of evaluation, and efficiency. There are problems in the lack of valid evaluation criteria and in the domination of PBTE by competencies which are easy to describe and evaluate.

## III. Competency-Based Education and Performance-Based Certification: A Survey of the States

Schmieder, Allen A. "Profile of the States in Competency-Based Education." PBTE 3, 5 (November 1974): 1-24.

Planning and implementation activities in competency-based teacher education and certification are briefly outlined for each state. The profile reflects the status as of July 1974. PBTE, a publication of the Multi-State Consortium on Performance-Based Teacher Education, contains current information on topics of interest to state agency certification and teacher education staff.

Performance-Based Teacher Certification: A Survey of the States, 1974. Lansing, Michigan: Michigan Department of Education, 1974. (ED 095 184)

This document is a followup study of a survey on performance-based teacher certification that was conducted in 1972. The present study indicates that an increased number of states are involved in performance-based teacher certification, although the level of activity in some instances has decreased. The information presented in this report is based primarily on direct communication with the State Department of Education in each state, and is given alphabetically by state. A brief description of the activity in each state is provided, ranging from one sentence to several paragraphs. A treatment of the definition of competency-based teacher certification is presented in an appendix.



#### IV. Teacher Competencies: Lists of Behaviors

Coker, Joan G. and Coker, Homer. Carroll County Generic Competency Areas, Teacher Behaviors, and Student Outcomes (Fourth Draft by Carroll County Teachers/West Georgia College). Carrollton, Georgia: Carroll County Competency Based Teacher Certification Project, 1974. (Unpublished)

Eleven generic areas of teacher competency are identified. Teacher behaviors, measurement technique, and expected student outcomes for each competency are briefly described. This working document will be further refined and modified by validation against student outcomes. Minimal levels of performance will be established for each validated competency area to provide a basis for professional certification.

DeKalb School System. (Teacher Competencies: List of Behaviors). DeKalb County, Georgia: Performance-Based Certification/Supportive Supervision Project, 1975. (Unpublished)

Twenty generic teacher competencies expected of a teacher at the end of an internship of 1-3 years on the job are identified. Performance criteria for nineteen of the competencies are defined. This is a working document for validating teacher competencies through student outcomes in a Georgia suburban system.

Houston, Robert W. (Teacher Competencies: List of Behaviors) Houston, Texas: University of Houston/Houston City School Systems, 1974. (Unpublished)

This list identifies and briefly describes sixteen areas of teacher competency as specified by personnel from the Houston City School System and the University of Houston.

Resource Document, Atlanta, Georgia: Ad hoc committee of the Teacher Education Council, Georgia Department of Education, 1974. (Unpublished)

#### V. Review of Research on Validated Teacher Competencies

Rosenshine, Barak and Furst, Norma. "Research on Teacher Performance Criteria," in Research and Teacher Education: A Symposium, B. Othanel Smith, Ed. New York: Prentice-Hall, Inc., 1971.

This review of research on teacher performance criteria focuses upon the relationships between teacher behaviors and student outcomes. Five teacher performance variables were found to have the strongest relationship to measures of student achievement: 1) clarity; 2) variability; 3) enthusiasm; 4) task-oriented or business-like behaviors; and 5) student opportunity to learn criterion material.

## VI. Assessment of Competencies

Baral, Laurie R., Comp. The Evaluation of Teachers: ERS Annotated Bibliography. Washington, D. C.: Educational Research Service, 1974. (ED 089 478)

To provide a useful reference to published and unpublished documents relating to teacher evaluation, a search was made of the Education Index, Research in Education (RIE), and Current Index to Journals in Education (CIJE), which resulted in this 125-item bibliography. The source for each entry is indicated, along with pricing and ordering information, if available. Abstracts from Research in Education are designated by ERIC document order numbers, and an EDRS order blank is provided.

Blount, Gail, Comp. Teacher Evaluation: An Annotated Bibliography. Current Bibliography No. 8. Toronto, Ontario: Ontario Institute for Studies in Education, 1974. (ED 093 033)

Three interrelated frames of reference--the purposes of evaluation, the criteria for evaluation, and the evaluators--form the basis of the major subject divisions of this bibliography. Part one consists of general material on teacher evaluation, teacher effectiveness, and supervisory practices. Attempts to determine the qualities of a good teacher are the major concern of materials listed in part two. Citations in part three emphasize the how, when and what of evaluation. A representative sample of the literature on classroom observation techniques is included in the latter, as well as material on student evaluation of teachers and self evaluation. Additionally, there is information on two recent objective-based innovations: performance-based evaluation and teaching performance tests. Part four brings together studies and reviews of research studies that investigate whether effective teaching can be scientifically determined. Of primary concern are attempts to correlate teacher behavior with positive changes in learners. The final section includes listings that cover this subject from an essentially Canadian point of view.

Coker, Homer. "Carroll County Competency Based Teacher Certification Project." ROME Newsletter 1, 2 (February 1975) : 2, 5.

This competency-based teacher certification project is designed to study the relationships between teacher behaviors and student outcomes. The project represents a major developmental effort of the Georgia Department of Education to obtain research information necessary to assess the feasibility of certifying teachers on the basis of performance. Goals and objectives for 1974-75 are briefly summarized.



Ellett, Chad D. and Payne, David A. "A Description of Activities Involved in Verifying and Assessing Principal Competence. ROME Newsletter 1, 2 (February 1975): 1, 6.

The purpose of Project ROME (Results Oriented Management in Education) is to develop an effective management design for school systems. A major component of Project ROME is the verification and assessment of principal competencies. This project is of particular interest since the identification of performance-based competency measures for administrators is an area which has received limited attention.

McDonald, Frederick J. "The National Commission on Performance-Based Education." Paper presented at the Annual Meeting of the American Educational Research Association, New Orleans, Louisiana, 1973. (ED 076 569)

The National Commission on Performance-Based Education was formed to coordinate and integrate nationally plans for performance-based teacher education. The goals of the commission are defining competence, evaluating it, training for it, and managing programs of performance-based education and certification. The initial programs of the commission include the creation of two task forces, one to begin the development of a taxonomy of teaching behaviors, the other to develop training programs for managers of performance-based systems. The commission also hopes to conduct a survey of current activity in the field and to create a center for the dissemination of this information.

Okey, James R. and Humphreys, Donald W. Measuring Teacher Competence. Paper presented at the annual meeting of the National Association for Research in Science Teaching, Chicago, Illinois, 1974. (ED 090 060)

Presented is a discussion of three types of teacher competencies: cognitive, performance, and consequence. The study identifies some methods for measuring outcomes in each of the three categories. Also discussed is the problem of designing research studies for investigating teacher effectiveness.

Performance-Based Teacher Education: An Annotated Bibliography. Washington, D. C.: American Association of Colleges for Teacher Education, 1971. (ED 050 034)

This 102-item annotated bibliography lists documents and journal articles published between 1967 and 1970. Citations are grouped under six categories or problems. The first section lists documents describing the characteristics of actual or proposed programs of performance-based teacher education. The second section contains items related to certifying teachers on the basis of performance, and the third section contains a selection from the literature on defining teacher competence. The basic elements of a performance-based curriculum are described in the fourth section, while the fifth deals with measuring the degree

to which performance objectives are achieved and cites sources of information about specific assessment techniques. The sixth and final section lists documents indicating the attitude of teacher organizations toward performance assessment.

Popham, W. James. "An Approaching Peril: Cloud-Referenced Tests." Phi Delta Kappan 55, 9 (May 1974): 614-15.

Popham clarifies the differences in function and construction of norm-and criterion-referenced tests. He also points out problems that educational evaluators may encounter in the use of commercially prepared criterion-referenced tests for program evaluation. Criterion-referenced instruments are being developed as a way of determining job-related teacher knowledge competency.

Quirk, Thomas J. "Some Measurement Issues in Competency-Based Teacher Education." Phi Delta Kappan 55, 5 (January 1974): 316-18.

Measurement of teacher competencies is a complex problem. The author examines some of the difficulties in constructing reliable and valid teacher competency measures.

#### VII. State Agency Roles in Planning, Developing and Implementing Competency-Based Teacher Education and Performance-Based Certification

Achieving the Potential of Performance-Based Teacher Education: Recommendations. Washington, D. C.: American Association of Colleges for Teacher Education, 1974.

This document contains twenty-one recommendations for implementing and improving performance-based teacher education. These recommendations resulted from three years of study by the Committee on Performance-Based Teacher Education. Major topics include 1) role definition, 2) development, validation, and dissemination of instructional materials, 3) role of the student in the instructional process, 4) assessment, 5) collaborative decision-making, 6) management, 7) costs and funding, 8) mandating, 9) accreditation and program approval, and 10) research design.

Andrews, Theodore E. Atlanta or Atlantis? Multi-State Consortium on Performance-Based Teacher Education. (no date)

This document provides a comprehensive conceptual framework for state agency personnel who are concerned with developing policies and implementing a performance-based teacher education and certification program. Alternative roles which state agencies might assume are described. In addition, Andrews analyzes the impact of competency-based education and certification policies on the Washington state education agency. A management plan developed in Utah for competency-based teacher education and certification is included.

Andrews, Theodore. "Its Wisdom and Its Folly" [Competency-Based Teacher Education]. Albany, New York, 1974. (ED 088 806)

This paper discusses factors in the development of a good state competency-based certification system. One is the leadership position of state certification personnel that enables them to promote far-reaching reforms in education. The competency movement should lead to a change in the way in which educational reforms are typically effected, since it can alter the locus of authority. The paper recommends that a diversified and localized value system be established which relates to the public's expectations for schools. States should support a certification system that adjusts to diversity of local values and challenges all to meet the highest level of accomplishment. State standards should never be rigid and procedures should be revised yearly based on constant feedback. With respect to teacher evaluation, a new type of teaching exam, designed to provide information relevant to teacher education, retention, and promotion, is described. The exam would consist of over 40 modules in four broad categories. Filmed episodes testing the candidate's ability to see and understand what is going on in the classroom are also suggested.

Kirst, Michael W. Issues in Governance for Performance-Based Teacher Education. Washington, D. C.: American Association of Colleges for Teacher Education, 1973.

The performance-based teacher education (PBTE) and certification movement affects a number of groups. Implementation of PBTE creates some fundamental changes in the "balance of power" among groups such as teacher organizations, parent groups, ethnic minorities, students, state legislators, state board members, university teacher trainers, and state departments of education. A number of issues are raised, but due to the embryonic state of PBTE answers are few. This is a thought-provoking document for those concerned with the problems of governance and performance-based certification.

Hopkins, John O. Basic Legal Issues in New York State on Teacher Certification. Lincoln, Nebraska: Study Commission on Undergraduate Education and the Education of Teachers, 1973. (ED 091 378)

This document deals with legal issues related to the function of government in licensing or certifying educators. It is the basic argument of this paper that the right and responsibility of the state to certify teachers is a legitimate, moral, and rational use of the political power of the state only to the extent that teacher certification protects and promotes some demonstrably legitimate public interest. The author limits his remarks to legal issues on teacher certification as found in New York State and New York City. The author notes that in these areas and in most of the United States constitutional and statutory law leave broad discretionary authority to public agencies charged with certifying teachers and administrators. The paper covers topics such as certification to protect students, parent role in teacher certification, protection of the rights of teachers and administrators, certification of school administrators as management or labor, job-relatedness of certification procedures, racial discrimination and certification procedures, and proposals to reform teacher preparation and certification policies in New York State.

Implementing Performance-Based Teacher Education at the State Level. Washington, D. C.: The American Association of Colleges for Teacher Education, 1973.

The Performance-Based Teacher Education Committee has prepared a position statement on the implementation of performance-based teacher education at the state level. Issues and concerns faced by state agencies in the development of policy are discussed. Based upon three years of study, the committee presents three recommendations for consideration by state agency decision-makers.

Roth, Robert A. Competency-Based Teacher Education and Certification Definitions: Synthesis and Schema. Lansing: Michigan State Department of Education, 1974. (ED 095 172)

This document is divided into an introduction and two sections. Each section is divided into two parts: definition and synthesis. Section one is devoted to competency-based teacher education. The "definition" part presents 14 definitions of competency-based teacher education that have been culled from various authorities. The "synthesis" part lists seven components that encompass all facets of programs that were defined in the "definition" part. The components are as follows: competencies, assessment, individualized instruction, field-centered component, systematic approach, general program characteristics, and decision-making processes. Each of these consists of several factors, which are also listed, the number varying with the component area. Section two is devoted to competency-based

BEST COPY AVAILABLE

teacher certification. Three definitions are given. The "synthesis" part describes the following models: informational process, alternative program, facilitation, mandate, generic competencies, specific competencies, criteria, and state assessment.

Solomon, Lester M. Developing Competency-Based Preparation and Performance-Based Certification in Georgia. Atlanta: Georgia Department of Education, 1974. (Unpublished)

Generic competencies are defined; the problems of their verification and validation are highlighted. Information on the movement toward performance-based certification in Georgia provides background for a description of the developmental projects currently in operation. The appendix lists major competency-based goals, developmental activities, key publications, and unique features. Names and addresses of persons who may be contacted for further information are included.